

Chullin – Simanim

פרק א – הכל שוחטין

דף יט – Daf 19

1. הגרים שלישי ושחט שלישי והגרים שלישי, or the opposite

The Gemara discusses: *if one cut a third of the קנה beyond the shechitah area, then cut a third within the correct area, and cut the final third beyond the correct area*, Rav Huna quotes Rav saying the animal is kosher, but Rav Yehudah quotes Rav saying it is not kosher. Rav Huna holds: *כי נפקא חיותא – when the animal's life left it* (i.e., the moment the majority of the קנה was cut), *בשחיטה קא נפקא – it left through shechitah*. Rav Yehudah holds *רובא בשחיטה וליכא – we require most of the קנה to be cut with shechitah, and that is lacking here*. In the opposite case, where he *shechted* the first third correctly, the middle third with *הגרמה*, and the final third correctly, Rav Yehudah quoted Rav saying it is kosher (since most of the קנה was cut correctly). Rav Huna said it was not kosher, and Rav Yehudah was upset, because Rav Huna appeared to rule the opposite of whatever Rav Yehudah said. Rav Huna considered retracting, but Rav Chisda said that his second ruling fits well with his first, since in this case, the animal's life left it through *הגרמה*, and is invalid.

2. Shechting through a hole in the קנה vs. shechting until a hole in the קנה

Rav Yehudah told Rav Kahana that *שחט במקום נקב – if one shechted through a hole which was torn halfway across the קנה, cutting slightly further so that the majority was cut, the shechitah is valid*. However, *שחט ופגע בו נקב – if he shechted halfway across and reached a hole in the back of the קנה, the shechitah is פסול*. Rebbe Elazar explained the difference: where he began the cutting from the hole, *נעשה כמי ששחט עובד כוכבים וגמר ישראל – it is as if an idolator cut halfway across and a Yisroel finished it, which is valid*, whereas where he cut until reaching the hole, it is as if a Yisroel *shechted* only halfway and the idolator finished it, which is invalid. Rebbe Yochanan declared: *עובד כוכבים, עובד כוכבים – "Idolator! Idolator!"*, objecting that he can explain away the rulings with comparisons to idolators all day, but they are not similar, as Rava explained: where the קנה began intact, and the Yisroel should have cut most of the קנה, and instead only cut half, *כי נפקא חיותא – when [the animal's] life left it*, *בידא דעובד כוכבים קא נפקא – it left through the idolator's hand*, which is invalid. But where the קנה was torn halfway and he cut more, thereby killing the animal, what difference is there if he began or ended with the hole?

3. מליקה is performed from the back of the bird's neck, the opposite of shechitah

The next Mishnah states: *if one shechts from the sides of the neck, the shechitah is valid, but מליקה from the sides of the neck is invalid*. If one *shechts* "מן העורף", it is invalid, but מליקה from the עורף is valid. The Gemara will explain this means *ממנל עורף – from that which faces the back of the head, i.e., the nape of its neck*. *Shechitah* מן הצוואר – *from the throat* is valid, but מליקה from the throat is invalid. The Mishnah explains that the entire עורף is fit for מליקה, and the entire צוואר is fit for *shechitah*. *It emerges that what is valid for shechitah is invalid for melikah* – *and what is valid for melikah is invalid for shechitah*. Rebbe Chiya's sons said: *מצות מליקה מחזיר סימנים לאחורי העורף ומולק – the mitzvah of melikah is performed where one first moves the סימנים around to the back of the neck and then performs melikah, without breaking the neck bone*. There are two versions if this means that *melikah* may also be performed this way, or must be performed this way, and the Gemara supports the former version.

Siman - Yacht

When the **yacht** was rocked by a wave the man *shechting* for dinner was startled and his **knife went one third beyond the shechitah area one third in the shechitah area and the final third out of the shechitah area**, his partner was *shechting* an animal with a hole in the *kaneh* while **עובד כוכבים עובד כוכבים** while a boy climbed up the flag pole to chase a pigeon to practice **melikah from the back of the neck**.

דף יט | DAF 19

Yacht



When the **yacht** was rocked by a wave the man *shechting* for dinner was startled and his **knife went one third beyond the shechitah area one third in the shechitah area and the final third out of the shechitah area**, his partner was *shechting* an animal with a hole in the *kaneh* while yelling עובד כובבים עובד כובבים while a boy climbed up the flag pole to chase a pigeon to practice *melikah* from the back of the neck.

3 things to remember

1. הגרים שלישי ושחט שלישי והגרים שלישי, or the opposite
2. *Shechting* through a hole in the קנה vs. *shechting* until a hole in the קנה
3. מליקה is performed from the back of the bird's neck, the opposite of *shechitah*

